

Design Review Board



Minutes

January 10, 2017
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Sean Banda – Chair
Tracy Roedel – Vice Chair
Brian Sandstrom
Taylor Candland
Randy Carter
Nicole Thompson
J. Seth Placko

Board Members Absent:

none

Staff Present:

John Wesley
Tom Ellsworth
Wahid Alam
Kim Steadman
Wahid Alam
Lisa Davis
Mia Lozano
Mike Gildenstern

Others Present:

Cody Bowman
Tristram Kesti
Daniel McPeak
David M. Brown
Joanne Leadley
Jennifer Corey
John Reddell
Trudy Licano
Mike Licano
Joel Ortega

Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

B. Call to Order

Chair Banda called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

C. Consider the Minutes from the December 13, 2016 meeting

On a motion by Boardmember Thompson and seconded by Boardmember Carter, the Board unanimously approved the December 13, 2016 minutes.

(Vote: 7-0)

D. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review cases:

D.1. DR17-041

Household Hazardous Waste Facility

LOCATION/ADDRESS:	2412 N. Center Street
REQUEST:	Review of a household hazardous waste facility
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	1
OWNER:	City of Mesa
APPLICANT:	Architekton
ARCHITECT:	John Cahoon
STAFF PLANNER:	Tom Ellsworth

Discussion: Tom Ellsworth gave a brief overview of the project. Applicant, John Cahoon presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Felt the building was too clunky, too quasi-mechanical, institutional in feel

Boardmember Carter

- Felt that the building was plain, typical
- Suggested that the angular canopy attached to the building should be refined and defined a little bit better.
- Concerned about the straight parapet line, and wanted a more fun design
- Suggested that the building play more off the angle established by the canopy

Boardmember Thompson

- Asked to have the exposed downspouts removed
- Liked the material colors

It was moved by Boardmember Sandstrom and seconded by Boardmember Carter to be continued to the February 14th, 2017 Work Session VOTE: (7-0)

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

Item A.1. DR16-031

**1131 – 1149 E. University Drive
(Continued from November 8, 2016)**

LOCATION/ADDRESS:	1131 – 1149 E. University Drive
REQUEST:	Review of a multi-residence
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	4
OWNER:	The Pre-Hab Foundation
APPLICANT:	Justin Francis, G.A. Haan Development, LLC
ARCHITECT:	CCBG Architects, Inc.
STAFF PLANNER:	Kim Steadman

Continuance to February 14, 2017 Meeting

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

Item A.2. DR16-041

**Jacinto Place
(Continued from November 8, 2016)**

LOCATION/ADDRESS:	2200 – 2300 Blocks of E. Jacinto Road
REQUEST:	Review of a multi-residence development
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	3
OWNER:	Genica Arizona, LLC
APPLICANT:	Nextgen Apartments
ARCHITECT:	Eric Miller
STAFF PLANNER:	Kim Steadman

Discussion: Applicant, Eric Miller presented the project to the Board.

David M. Brown, 1845 S. Rose Circle, a neighbor, spoke in support of the modified color proposal for the project.

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Liked the new colors, massing, articulation, and reveals
- Didn't like the blue spruce color, wanted to confirm that the color examples shown in the Meeting will translate correctly to the building when it is constructed

Boardmember Carter

- Felt that the applicant did an excellent job, and appreciated the warm neutral colors

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A.3. DR16-044

Contempo

LOCATION/ADDRESS:	7400 block of E. Ray Road
REQUEST:	Review of an industrial building
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	6
OWNER:	Phx-Mesa Gateway Airport 193
APPLICANT:	Eric Zitny, Ware Malcolmb
ARCHITECT:	Kevin Evernham, Ware Malcomb
STAFF PLANNER:	Wahid Alam

Discussion: Applicant, Eric Zitny presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Liked the use of red on the project

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Liked the proposed modifications

Boardmember Roedel

- Liked the design

Chair Banda

- Liked the proposed changes and liked the new canopies, but proposed that the canopies reach appropriately around the corner of the building

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A.4. DR17-002

West Ella Senior Living Community

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 2230 W. Ella Street
REQUEST: Review of a new Senior Living Facility
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 3
OWNER: Terra AZ, LLC
APPLICANT: Tristan Kesti
ARCHITECT: Perlman Architects
STAFF PLANNER: Mia Lozano

Discussion: Applicant, Tristan Kesti presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Liked the proposed handrails, appreciated the retro “60’s” aesthetic
- Liked the colors
- Suggested using perforated metal plates with round holes on patios instead of railings

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Liked the rendering, make sure colors match,
- Proposed using larger signage and address numbering, more lighting, and better screening on balconies
- Suggested addressing blank walls, possibly using metal paneling to break up the mass
- Proposed using 8 foot doors
- Suggested using powder-coated break metal panels for railings and painting them to match the back of the patio wall

Boardmember Roedel

- Liked the added color
- Was concerned about junk piled on balconies, and the applicant stated that the project owner will include a regulation for that in the residential lease agreement

Boardmember Carter

- Liked the added color
- Liked the proposed balcony railings, instead of perforated metal, appreciated the openness

Chair Banda

- Like the project overall, liked the updated integral colored block wall
- Proposed a stepped-up lighting plan
- Liked the “retro” aesthetic of the sign, proposed retro lighting onto the eaves of the building

Boardmember Placko

- Suggested that the mastic trees proposed between the parking lot and the perimeter wall may not be a good choice, as they may outgrow their planter
- Appreciated the accurate site and landscape plan coordination

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A.5. DR17-003

Gateway Norte Car Wash

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 4225 S. Power Road
REQUEST: Review of new car wash
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 6
OWNER: GBSP LLC – Trudy Licano
APPLICANT: Jen Corey, Zoning Strategies
ARCHITECT: John Reddell Architects, Inc.
STAFF PLANNER: Kim Steadman

Discussion: Applicant, Jennifer Corey presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Suggested the building could be modern, instead of Tuscan.
- Suggested using lighting as a design element. Suggested wall-mounted lighting along the flat north wall.

Boardmember Roedel

- Agreed the Tuscan could be toned down.

Boardmember Carter

- Is the choice of style constrained by design guidelines for the overall development? (The applicant confirmed that it is.)
- Too monochromatic. If the guidelines are open enough, consider bringing in other colors.
- Redesign the tower element for more interest.
- Look at Venice for ideas.
- Vacuum canopy color may need to change to work with the ultimate design/colors.
- The design should come back for a second work session.

Boardmember Thompson

- The car wash could comply with the design guidelines by incorporating elements of the proposed “Santa Barbara” redesign for the adjacent retail building.
- The circular tower would be better with some design elements from the proposed retail redesign.

Boardmember Candland

- Agreed the circular tower is less successful than the tower element proposed for the north end of the retail building.

Chair Banda

- Agreed with the other comments
- Felt it needed to come back

The Board requested that the project be back to the Board for review with the changes discussed.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A.6. DR17-004

Mini-Storage Facility

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 4550 E. Southern Avenue
REQUEST: Review of a new mini-storage and RV facility
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 2
OWNER: RNF Investments/Meridian Properties/Farnsworth ETAL
APPLICANT: Fred Woods
ARCHITECT: Fred Woods
STAFF PLANNER: Wahid Alam

Discussion: Applicant, Fred Woods presented the project to the Board.

Joanne Ludley, at 1021 S. Greenfield, #1159, expressed concern with the landscape plan for the project. Ms. Ludley stated that the 15' planting strip adjacent to the property calling for Sissoo trees may be not be large enough to accommodate a species that tends to be invasive to surrounding properties. Ms. Ludley proposed using trees that have a less invasive root system and canopy, and for the barbed wire along the wall to be removed, as well. Additionally, Ms. Ludley asked that any eucalyptus trees on the property also be removed.

Boardmember Thompson

- Was concerned about the condition the landscaping and the wall along Southern Avenue
- Didn't like the chosen colors
- Didn't want faux stone used on wall

Chair Banda

- Suggested that the wall along Southern Avenue be improved, and possibly include some articulation and/or fenestration
- Suggested incorporating just a touch of corporate colors into the design
- Confirmed with the applicant that upgraded wall packs will be used for lighting on primary buildings, parking areas, and storage units.

Boardmember Carter

- Confirmed that the tree species along the rear landscape strip was not specified in the landscape plan in the Planning & Zoning hearing
- Did not like the chosen colors, especially when overly visible from the street, suggesting that there was too much grey
- Proposed planting large shrubs and trees along Southern Avenue to minimize the appearance of the wall

Boardmember Placko

- Suggested possibly using ocotillos, chollas, mastic trees, cascalote trees, etc., that would fit in the 15' rear landscape strip.
- Was concerned about the maintenance program of the proposed sissoo trees. If the sissoo was to be chosen, he suggested a deep-watering technique so the roots would grow down, instead of out

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017

- Proposed letting the existing shrubs grow with less restrictive pruning to dress up the long wall along Southern Avenue
- Proposed using 24 to 36 gallon trees with enhanced shrubbery along the Southern Avenue frontage

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Felt that there was too much blue used in the design, suggested that the parapet cap be blue, but use another color for the roof
- Suggested using cholla and/or bougainvillea instead of the existing barbed wired along the rear property line

Boardmember Roedel

- Concerned about the design of the wall, and the office, as they are the most visible

The Board agreed that the mini-storage design component was approved but the rest of the project come back to the Board for review with the changes discussed.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A.7. DR17-005

Automobile Sales Facility

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 200 Block of South Alma School Road (east side)
REQUEST: This request will allow development of an automobile sales facility.
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 6
OWNER: Kadkhoda, LLC
APPLICANT: Pedram Kadkhodaian
STAFF PLANNER: Lisa Davis

Discussion: Applicant, Pedram Kadkhodaian presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Didn't like the low roof
- Felt that the design was dated and that this is an opportunity to provide a more interesting design especially adjacent to Alma School Road.
- Referred to the fire station built across Alma School Road. Suggested to utilize the materials and design of that project as inspiration for the design of this project. Proposed possibly using CMU block, concrete, metal paneling, more glass
- Proposed creating a contrast in color, a contrast in materials, height variation, and undulation
- Proposed a more uniquely-shaped roof
- Suggested a more modern landscape planting palette

Boardmember Carter

- Suggested a more angular roof, and a more significant use of overhangs
- Didn't like the plain red roof
- Proposed using more color, and integrating creative signage in to the design
- Suggested an inverted roof, supported by columns
- This a small building and provides a great opportunity to create something visually interesting.

Chair Banda

- Didn't like brick veneer
- Suggested more modern elements, possibly using CMU block
- Suggested modern landscaping
- Would like to see a better use of color

Boardmember Placko

- Commented that the landscape plan should be modified to reflect a more accurate canopy spread for the trees at maturity. Plan is currently showing an 8' diameter canopy, should be allowing enough room for a 24' diameter canopy, otherwise the trees will crowd each other at full growth

The Board required that the project come back to the Board for review after the revisions that address the items discussed.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A.8. DR17-006

Union Brickyard Indoor/Outdoor Restaurant

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 1017 N. Dobson Road
REQUEST: This request will allow development of an indoor/outdoor restaurant
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 1
OWNER: Kimco
APPLICANT: Russell Young, Union Brickyard
ARCHITECT: Daniel McPeak
STAFF PLANNER: Tom Ellsworth

Discussion: Applicant, Russell Young presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Wanted more visible signage

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Liked the proposed canopy between the two buildings
- Felt that the Riverview color palette is dated, and suggested exploring a different direction regarding color
- Proposed that the canopy be elevated up off the roofline so it becomes a more prominent element, another 6' possibly.

Boardmember Carter

- Suggested more height, and a more vertical element facing Loop 202

Chair Banda

- Doesn't like the color palette at Riverview, wanted the project to stand out more, as a more independent, contemporary element
- Liked the unique direction for colors
- Liked the proposed complimentary interior up-lighting on the ceiling

The Board requested that the proposed canopy be approved, but the project should come back to the Board for review with the changes discussed and additional design concerns.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

A.9. DR17-007

Bread Lady Bakery

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 406 N. Val Vista Drive
REQUEST: This request will allow development of a bakery
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 1
OWNER: David A. Johnson
APPLICANT: Heather Thomas
ARCHITECT: Fred Woods, Woods Associates Architects
STAFF PLANNER: Kim Steadman

Discussion: Applicant, Fred Woods presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Liked the design
- Would like to see more blue on the project
- Liked the discussed “retro” metal sign, as a nice complement to the building

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Liked the color palette
- Confirmed that the applicant will be keeping most of the mature landscaping on the property
- Proposed using a more architectural shingle on the building rather than 3-tab standard shingle
- Confirmed with the applicant that there will be a bakery, a boutique, and a deli in the building
- Proposed adding to the existing trailing vines on the property as a green screen to complement the proposed fence
- Would like to see more adaptive-reuse projects like this

Boardmember Carter

- Proposed using an accent color of blue on the building
- Doesn't like the grey, would like a warmer color for the building
- Appreciates this project as an opportunity to showcase older Mesa architecture, for re-use and modification for other uses

Boardmember Placko

- Suggested removing some of the trees to allow in more sunlight and promote visibility
- Suggested that the 5 sissoo trees in the northwest corner of the project are too large for the space, and proposed using different species

Chair Banda

- Proposed using architecturally dimensioned shingles to minimize the form of the roof
- Confirmed with the applicant that steel frame and putty windows will be used for the building
- Confirmed with the applicant that the chain link fence will be removed and replaced with hedges and eventually a masonry and iron fence

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017

- Suggested using grey masonry with a capstone for the proposed buffer wall
- Suggested using up-lighting on overhangs, and more accent lighting

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
January 10, 2017**

E. Other Business:

Item E.1. Review and provide staff feedback for an alternative screening method for rooftop mechanical equipment at a Popeye's Chicken Restaurant at 1431 South Crismon Road.

Staff Planner: Wahid Alam

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Felt that the unit should be screened

Chair Banda

- Felt that the screening changes the plane of the roofline

On a motion by Boardmember Roedel and seconded by Boardmember Thompson, Item E.1 was approved.

(Vote: 7-0)

F. Adjournment

On a motion by Boardmember Carter and seconded by Boardmember Placko, the meeting adjourned at 7:00 pm.

(Vote: 7-0)

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644-3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644-2767.**